Abstract: This is a series of papers that translate and analyze articles, reports, religious decrees, and other documents, written primarily in Arabic by Islamist scholars, clerics, operatives, or intellectuals.

Should we Laugh or Cry? -- The Teddy Bear Crisis in Sudan

By Moshe Terdman

Introduction
On November 28, 2007, the Sudanese government charged a 54-year-old British teacher from Liverpool, Gillian Gibbons, with inciting religious hatred after she allowed her elementary school pupils to name a teddy bear “Muhammad,” an offence that could subject her to forty lashes, six months in prison and a fine. She was charged under article 125 of Sudan's constitution which relates to insulting religion and inciting hatred.¹

It all began when Gibbons—who had been working in Unity High School since August 2007, after leaving her position as deputy head teacher at a primary school in Liverpool—was teaching her pupils, who were around age seven, about animals. She asked one of them to bring in her teddy bear, and asked the students to pick names for it. They proposed Abdullah, Hassan and Muhammad, and in September 2007, the pupils voted to name it Muhammad. Each child was allowed to take the bear home on weekends and was told to write a diary about what they did with it. The diary entries were collected in a book with the bear's picture in the cover, labeled, "My Name is Muhammad". On November 25 2007, Gibbons was arrested, following a complaint made apparently by the

parents of some of her pupils to Sudan's Ministry of Education, accusing her of naming the bear after the Prophet. Although initially it was thought that the complaint had originated from a parent of one of the children at the school, it was later revealed that an office assistant, Sara Khawad, had filed the complaint and was the key witness for the prosecution. Although Muhammad is a common name among Muslim men, giving this name, which happens to be the Prophet's name too, to an animal, would be seen as insulting by many Muslims.  

In order to understand the background for the crisis, some words about Unity High School, in which Gillian Gibbons taught, are in order. Unity High School was founded in 1902 as an all-girls' school. In the preceding years, the Coptic community in Khartoum had established a boy's school but lacked the resources to found a girl's school at that time. Some Coptic families then approached the Anglican missionary Llewellyn Gwynne (who later became the Bishop of Khartoum) for help, and in 1902 the school was opened. In 1928, the school was renamed Unity High School, which reflected both the interdenominational origin and support the school received, as well as the school's policy of welcoming girls from both Muslim and Christian families. The school remained a girls' school until 1985, when boys were admitted for the first time. The following year a primary section was opened in response to parents' requests. Nowadays, it is a private English-language school with elementary to high school levels, which provides a British-style education with local modifications to cover Arabic language and Islamic and Christian religious studies to children, 90 percent of whom are Muslims, mostly from upper-class Sudanese families. In 2005, some 750 pupils from 4 to 18 years of age were enrolled there. It is administered by a council whose members represent the different Christian denominations found in the city.

Indeed, from the above mentioned information about the school, it seems like Gibbons made nothing more than an innocent mistake by simply following a British National Curriculum course designed to teach young pupils about animals and their habitats, and letting her pupils choose their favorite name for the toy, without knowing that calling a teddy bear Muhammad would bring such uproar.

---


The Sudanese Position – Between Moderation and Extremism

In order to appease the Sudanese Muslims and to lower the flames as much as possible, several Sudanese newspapers ran a statement reportedly from the school two days after Gibbons' arrest, saying the administration "offers an official apology to the students and their families and all Muslims from what came from an individual initiative". It said Gibbons had been "removed from her work at school". The school itself was closed as staff feared reprisals from Islamic extremists. Robert Boulos, the school's director, said on November 26 that the incident had been blown out of all proportion, but added that the school would remain closed until January 2008 to let ill feelings blow over.4

Furthermore, the seven-years-old student who inspired the naming of the teddy bear defended the teacher and insisted she was not trying to insult Islam. The boy, called Muhammad, said on November 27, that "the teacher asked me what I wanted to call the teddy. I said Muhammad. I named it after my name". The boy said he was not thinking about the prophet when he made his choice, and described Ms. Gibbons as a "very nice" teacher who did not mention religion in class.5

Therefore, it is not surprising that on November 27, the Sudanese Foreign Ministry played down the significance of the case, calling it "isolated despite our condemnation and rejection of it". A ministry spokesman, Ali al-Sadiq, said it was an incident of a "teacher's misconduct against the Islamic faith" but noted the school's apology.6

However, the Sudanese government position appeared to toughen on November 28, with a statement from the nation's top Muslim clerics calling for Gibbons to be punished according to the nation's Shari'ah, or Islamic law. According to the news reports, the Sudanese Assembly of the Ulama said that "what has happened was not haphazard or carried out of ignorance, but rather a calculated action and another ring in the circles of plotting against Islam". The statement further said that "it is part of the so-called war against terrorism and the intense media campaign against Islam".7

---

4 See on-line at: http://www.time.com/time/world/article/0,8599,1687755,00.html; http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/news/world/africa/article2951262.ece


On the background to the Sudanese government's change of heart seems to be the tension prevalent between Great Britain and Sudan over the conflict in Darfur. Thus, it could be pressing the teddy bear case as leverage against the intense criticism from Britain and other Western countries over its handling of the Darfur crisis and against the threat of UK sanctions against Sudan if peace talks failed. On November 27, the top UN peacekeeping official reported to the Security Council that the Sudanese government was blocking efforts to deploy a UN-backed peacekeeping force in Darfur, which might have heightened even more the tension between Sudan and Great Britain.  

Farina Alam, editor of Q-News, a leading Muslim magazine in Britain, said she also suspected the Khartoum government was saying to the West "We are going to show how tough we are". Alam said she visited Darfur and Khartoum in August on a British government-sponsored humanitarian mission. She said she found that there were "elements of the government that are upset about the embarrassment caused by world criticism." Alam said that "this could be possibly a revenge, or leverage," and the Sudanese government was "hypocritical" to prosecute Gibbons when its actions in Darfur were a much greater affront to Muslim value.

**Criticism and Condemnation of Sudan by Western Moderate Muslims**
Whatever might be the reason, the charge against Gillian Gibbons heightened even more the tension prevalent between Sudan and Great Britain. On November 28, the British Prime Minister, Gordon Brown, said in a statement that he was "surprised and disappointed" at the charging of Gibbons. Foreign Secretary, David Miliband, summoned the Sudanese ambassador "as a matter of urgency" to discuss the prosecution.

While Great Britain was pursuing diplomatic moves to free Gibbons, most Britons expressed shock at the verdict by a court in Khartoum, alongside hope it would not raise tensions between Muslims and non-Muslims in Great Britain. However, many Muslim organizations in Great Britain publicly condemned the Sudanese over their reactions,
taking the view that the whole thing was an innocent mistake on Gillian Gibbons' part and that no offence was intended. Muhammad Abdul Bari, Secretary-General of the Muslim Council of Britain, accused the Sudanese authorities of "gross overreaction". On November 28, he said in a statement urging Sudan to release Gibbons from her "shameful ordeal," that "this is a disgraceful decision and defies common sense. There was clearly no intention on the part of the teacher to deliberately insult the Islamic faith". He further said that "this case should have required only simple common sense to resolve. It is unfortunate that the Sudanese authorities were found wanting in this most basic of qualities". The Muslim Public Affairs Committee, a political advocacy group, said the prosecution was "abominable and defies common sense". The Federation of Student Islamic Societies, which represents 90,000 Muslim students in Great Britain and Ireland, called on Sudan's government to free Gibbons, saying she had not meant to cause any offense. The group's president, Ali al-Hadithi, said that "we are deeply concerned that the verdict to jail a schoolteacher due to what is likely to be an innocent mistake is gravely disproportionate". The Ramadhan Foundation, a Muslim youth organization, said Sudanese President Omar al-Bashir should pardon the teacher. Its spokesman, Mohammed Shafiq, said that "the Ramadhan Foundation is disappointed and horrified by the conviction of Gillian Gibbons in Sudan". Archbishop of Canterbury, Rowan Williams, said that Gibbons' prosecution and conviction was "an absurdly disproportionate response to what is at worst a cultural faux pas".11

The case put Sudan's government in an embarrassing position – facing the anger of Great Britain and the condemnation of Muslim organizations in Great Britain over its conduct on one side, and facing potential trouble from powerful Islamic hard-liners from within Sudan on the other. So, in what could be an attempt to appease both sides, although Gibbons was found guilty of insulting religion and inciting hatred, she was sentenced on November 29, just to 15 days in jail and then a deportation from Sudan. Since she had already spent five days in prison, she would serve only ten more days.12

Great Britain, meanwhile, continued to pursue diplomatic moves to free Gibbons. Foreign Secretary David Miliband summoned the Sudanese ambassador late on November 29 to express Britain's disappointment with the verdict. The Foreign Office said Britain would continue diplomatic efforts to achieve "a swift resolution" to the crisis.13

In the meantime, moderate Muslims in Great Britain, the US, and Canada had been swift to condemn the events in Sudan. Leading members of the British Muslim community

12 See on-line at: http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/africa/7115400.stm
13 See on-line at: http://www.foxnews.com/story/0,2933,314111,00.html
expressed outrage over a decision they said could increase misunderstanding between Muslims and non-Muslims. Asghar Bukhari of the Muslim Public Affairs Committee, a group that advocates greater Muslim involvement in the democratic process, said that "this is unbelievable, a travesty of justice, a disgrace -- what planet are they on? Things like this make our differences seem like they are unbridgeable. If you don't really know another community, and all you ever hear is these outrageous, alien, unjust things they are doing, you are going to think, 'We've got nothing in common.'"

Daisy Khan, director of the American Society for Muslim Advancement, said that "what we are looking at here is a cultural 'faux pas' and there is a political undercurrent that is running through this furor". She rejected the idea that naming the teddy bear Muhammad was inherently blasphemous and said that "there is nothing sacred about the name Muhammad and anybody can use it". Khan rejected the idea that the protestors' actions were appropriate for devout believers. She said that "the Sudanese people need to be reminded that the Prophet had always said that the greatest gift you can give your children is the gift of education". In the United Kingdom, Muslim leaders were horrified about the incident. Dr. Ghayas al-Din Siddiqui, leader of the Muslim Parliament in Great Britain, said that "the Muslim community here has also expressed that this is simply unacceptable behavior from the Sudanese government, and I think the Sudanese have got to realize that this episode is doing immense damage to their credibility outside".

The American Islamic Congress – a civil-rights organization promoting tolerance and the exchange of ideas among Muslims and between other peoples - demanded Gibbons' immediate release from prison. Nasser Weddady, the organization's Civil Rights Outreach Director said that “we denounce this fabricated outrage,” and that “the Sudanese government’s ridiculous case trivializes the feelings of Muslims around the world”. Weddady explained that "the sad legacy of the Danish cartoon riots is that we have to speak out immediately when extremists try to provoke clashes over trivial matters. This is not about cultural sensitivities. There is no excuse for someone to be sent to jail and whipped over a teddy bear's name. Ms. Gibbons needs to be freed at once.

The Muslim Canadian Congress organized a teddy bear mail-in to protest Sudan's imprisonment of Gillian Gibbons. Tarek Fatah, MCC's founder, asked the group's

---


members to send tiny teddy bears to Faiza Hassan Taha, Sudan's ambassador in Ottawa, as a protest. He said that "this woman should be released immediately and in fact the Sudanese government should apologize to her for treating her [this way], because this is contrary to any tradition of Islam. If people don't protest this, against this lunacy, where will our political correctness lead us to?\textsuperscript{17}

A Clash of Cultures

While this protest and condemnation was taking place among moderate Muslims outside Sudan, in Sudan itself radical Muslims condemned Gibbons' actions. On November 29, immediately after the verdict was given a statement circulated by members of the Muslim Brotherhood said that "we want to express our boiling anger and deep sorrow about this case caused by this British teacher. We want to tell you that the majority of Sudanese are Muslims so we love our Prophet Muhammad so much and we decry this careless way of dealing with our beloved Prophet". One of the statement's authors, 27-years-old al-Sheikh al-Nur, added that "if she made an innocent mistake and did not mean Muhammad the Prophet there is no problem. But if she did mean Muhammad the Prophet, she must die". Leaflets distributed outside Khartoum's Great Mosque urged Muslims to march on November 30 in protest of Ms. Gibbons' actions. They condemned what they described as "flagrant aggression" against the Prophet and asked imams to address the subject in Friday prayers. The leaflets added that "what has been done by this infidel lady is considered a matter of contempt and an insult to Muslims' feelings and also the pollution of children's mentality as an attempt to wipe their identity".\textsuperscript{18}

Thus, on November 30, Muslim imams encouraged worshippers at Friday sermons to march through the streets in protest. They chanted that "no one lives who insults the Prophet". Sheikh Hussein Mubarak told thousands of at al-Safa Mosque in the eastern Jarif district that the court's "verdict was lenient out of fear of criticism from human rights organizations, America and the West". Sheikh Mubarak railed at what he said was an attempt "to transform Sudan from an Islamic state into a Christian state", adding the British teacher had come to Sudan "as part of that plot". He asked "why did this teacher come to Sudan? She surely didn't need to emigrate from her country for the money? So she came for another reason". A Muslim cleric at Khartoum's main Martyrs Mosque denounced Gibbons during one sermon, saying she intentionally insulted Islam. However, he did not call for protests. The cleric, Abdul Jalil Nazeer al-Karouri, a well-known hard-liner, told worshippers that "imprisoning this lady does not satisfy the thirst of Muslims in Sudan. But we welcome imprisonment and expulsion". He said further that

\textsuperscript{17} See on-line at: http://www.financialpost.com/Story.html?id=136705

\textsuperscript{18} See on-line at: http://www.thisislondon.co.uk/news/article-23423342-details/Teddy+bear+teacher+appears+in+court+as+Islamic+fanatics+demand+execution/article.do
"this arrogant woman who came to our country, cashing her salary in dollars, teaching our children hatred of our Prophet Muhammad".  

So, hundreds of Sudanese, many armed with clubs and knives, streamed out of the mosques after Friday sermons as pickup trucks with loudspeakers blared massages against Gibbons and demanded the execution of Gibbons, saying "No tolerance: Execution" and "Kill her, kill her by firing squad". They massed in central Martyrs Square outside the presidential palace, where hundreds of riot police were deployed. They did not try to stop the rally, which lasted about an hour and in which the protesters chanted "Shame, shame on the UK". Several hundred protesters, not openly carrying weapons, marched from the square to Unity High School, about a mile away, where Gibbons worked. They chanted slogans outside the school, which was closed and under heavy security, then headed toward the nearby British Embassy. They were stopped by security forces two blocks away from the embassy. In response to the demonstration, Gibbons was moved from the women's prison near Khartoum to a secret location for her safety.  

On November 29, the protest arose despite vows by Sudanese security officials during Gibbons' trial, that threatened demonstrations after Friday prayers would not take place. Some of the protesters carried green banners with the name of the Society for the Support of the Prophet Muhammad, a previously unknown group. On December 2, Sudan's influential Council of Muslim Scholars had urged the government not to pardon Gibbons, saying it would damage Khartoum's reputation among Muslims around the world. About 50 demonstrators shouting "there is no God but Allah" and "we will die for the Prophet Muhammad" handed over a petition to the embassy about the affair. The Council spokesman, al-Sheikh Muhammad Abd al-Karim, said that the sentence was already too light and to free her now would "wound the sensibilities of Muslims. If the government retracts this judgment… this would be a very bad precedent and it would have very bad consequences on the reputation of the state… not only in Sudan but also outside Sudan". He further said that "this is not a matter to be settled politically. This is a matter which goes to the very core of Muslims and their sensibilities".  

But, to no avail. The Sudanese government gave in to British pressure to pardon Gibbons, especially after State Department spokesman, Sean McCormack, told reporters on
November 30, following the protest in Khartoum, that "we are very supportive of the British government in this regard. They are working to get their citizen back". He further said that "there is a shared assessment that the punishment that has been imposed on this woman is in every way excessive". On December 3, Gibbons was pardoned following requests from Britain to commute her sentence of 15 days in jail. She said that she is "sad to be leaving Sudan" after being granted full presidential pardon. Sudanese president, Omar al-Bashir, pardoned the teacher after meeting two British Muslim peers, Lord Nazir Ahmed and Baroness Sayeeda Warsi, who accompanied her in the flight back to Britain amid tight security. In a written statement Gibbons said that she was sorry if she had caused distress and added that she had "great respect" for Islam.  

A Sudanese government spokesman said he hoped the decision to release Gibbons would improve relations between Great Britain and Sudan. But he said that "there was a political risk in this decision. Although the pardon is a presidential prerogative, because of the rising feeling and tensions that have been generated many Sudanese will see it as unfair to them and that it might encourage others to do the same. The President considered the intentions behind [her] actions when he made this decision [to pardon]."

Conclusion – A Failed Clash of Cultures

November 30's demonstration in Khartoum calling for a British teacher to be executed for insulting Islam is the latest phase in the clash of cultures between Islam and the West. These our times clashes began on February 14, 1989, when British writer Salman Rushdie was condemned to death by a fatwa published by Iran's Ayatollah Ruhollah Khomeini for what are considered to be blasphemous statements in his book "The Satanic Verses". On November 20-23, 2002 more than 220 people were killed and 1,100 injured in northern Nigeria in clashes between Muslims and Christians, after a local newspaper published an article about the Miss World contest which was judged blasphemous by Muslims. In the article a young journalist said the Prophet Mohammed would not have objected the contest and would even have chosen to marry one of the contestants. The contest was moved from the Nigerian capital Abuja to London. On November 2, 2004 Dutch filmmaker Theo van Gogh was murdered in an Amsterdam street by a young Islamic extremist, Mohammed Bouyeri, over his criticism of the position of women under Islam in his film "Submission." In February 2006, demonstrations erupted around the world after the Danish newspaper Jyllands-Posten published, in September 2005, a dozen cartoons of the Prophet Mohammed. In September 2006 Pope Benedict XVI sparked

---

See on-line at: [http://www.bloomberg.com/apps/news?pid=20601102&sid=a6ybCoTJBV.M&refer=uk](http://www.bloomberg.com/apps/news?pid=20601102&sid=a6ybCoTJBV.M&refer=uk); [http://www.albawaba.com/en/countries/Sudan/219543](http://www.albawaba.com/en/countries/Sudan/219543); [http://www.guardian.co.uk/sudan/story/0,,2221020,00.html](http://www.guardian.co.uk/sudan/story/0,,2221020,00.html); [http://afp.google.com/article/ALeqM5jq2AL-ZX4Mg-UEYRIY_gW8q7G6Xg](http://afp.google.com/article/ALeqM5jq2AL-ZX4Mg-UEYRIY_gW8q7G6Xg)

See on-line at: [http://www.guardian.co.uk/sudan/story/0,,2221020,00.htm](http://www.guardian.co.uk/sudan/story/0,,2221020,00.htm)
outrage in the Muslim world in remarks interpreted as linking Islam and violence. On August 18, 2007, a Swedish cartoonist faced a slew of death threats over his depiction of the Prophet Mohammed as a dog in a cartoon.

Yet, unlike the other clashes, it seems that this one could have been prevented and has nothing to do with religious issues, but with political ones. It seems like Sudan has tried to use this case to distract the Sudanese from main internal issues: the problems between the authorities in the north and south of the country, the Darfur crisis and the question of letting in UN peacekeepers. Another aim of the Sudanese government might have been to take revenge against the West, which has been criticizing Sudan harshly for its actions in Darfur. Yet, another possible aim might have been to raise tensions between Muslims and non-Muslims in Great Britain as well as in the West.

The teddy bear case echoes last year's controversy over the Danish cartoons lampooning Muhammad. Nonetheless, while the Danish case caused genuine offense and outrage among Muslims worldwide, the teddy bear case appears to have embarrassed and saddened many Muslims, especially those who live in the West. They wished to prevent a greater misunderstanding than the one already existing between Muslims and non-Muslims. Still, this clash points to a problem within the Islamic world concerning the issue of freedom of speech in general, and concerning Prophet Muhammad, the Qur’an, and other aspects of religion, in particular.

The Teddy Bear case also remained local and failed to erode the Muslim world. It might have been the awareness of the innocent nature of this case, compare to the so-called “vicious” nature of the others. For political reasons, the Sudanese government hurried up to fold its flag of creating anti-Western Islamic animosity. Unlike in previous cases, the reaction of the British government was firm and quick. There should be a lesson for both sides.